

**IN THE OFFICE OF THE VALLEY COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS  
CASCADE, IDAHO  
September 8, 2009**

**PRESENT: GERALD “JERRY” WINKLE) CHAIRMAN  
FRANK W. ELD) Excused Absence (COMMISSIONER)  
GORDON L. CRUICKSHANK)**

**ARCHIE N. BANBURY, CLERK**

Meeting called to order by Chairman Winkle at 9:03 a.m.

Cynda Herrick presented the Prairie Pine Final Plat for consideration. It is a two-lot subdivision off Heinrich Lane. The subdivision includes .3 acres of public right-of-way. Commissioner Cruickshank moved to approve the plat for Prairie Pine Subdivision, approve the Road Development Agreement in the amount of \$2,808.00, accept the .3 acres of public right-of-way along Heinrich Lane, not record until the check for the Road Development Agreement has been received, and authorize the Chairman to sign the Plat. Seconded by Chairman Winkle and carried.

Chairman Winkle opened a public hearing on South Lake Recreational Water and Sewer District. It is an appeal and an open public hearing. No ex-parte or conflict of interest exists. Commissioner Cruickshank noted that he had attended meetings with Carol MacGregor when land acquisition was considered. Chairman Winkle noted that David MacGregor had explained where the treatment plant would be placed and how it would look. Chairman Winkle noted that he had spoken to Commissioner Eld who had no ex-parte contact. Commissioner Cruickshank noted that he had attended public meetings of the South Lake Board of Directors.

First to be heard were the proponents.

Cynda Herrick presented her staff report. (*See staff report for consolidation*)

John Mabbutt, Board Chairman of South Lake, spoke concerning treatment site being acceptable and no other being available because it is the only site volunteered and it is at the low point in the district which facilitates gravity flow. Odor should not be a problem. He understands the road for access is in need of upgrading to meet current standards, and landscaping would be acceptable.

A C.U.P. is appropriate at this time. The plant is flexible and can be made less obtrusive. Proposed building location is ¼ mile from any other buildings in the area. The site, location, financing and other concerns should be addressed concurrently. Groundwater should be of no concern. The only pond would be that as required by the Fire District. Traffic generated by or from the site would not affect the road.

Asked for reconsideration so that they may proceed to obtain additional permits.

John Harry, 1452 W Powder Court, Eagle, agreed with Mr. Mabbutt.

Leonard Kopp, 7171 Obsidian Dr., Boise, also agreed with Mr. Mabbutt.

Carl Broadbent, 5865 W. Mountain Road, Cascade, agreed with Mr. Mabbutt. There are few, if any, alternative sites.

No uncommitted.

Opponents.

Ardean Grefsrud, 1331 Polecat Rd, Cascade. His septic system works just fine and sees no reason for a sewer system on Polecat Ridge. This was supposed to be water and sewer but water has been dropped. Fee is \$20,000 per household and then add the water system for an additional cost. Opposed on the basis he can't afford it.

Tom Alderson, 432 Hartley Road, Cascade. Strongly opposed to it, former board member. Worked with City Council to get City water, 80 feet away. City Council denied him. His sewer and water system works just fine now. Cost factor is "plumb ridiculous".

William Rice, 91 Panoramic Drive, Cascade, agreed with Alderson, too expensive and uncalled for.

Lois Hartley, 197 Bear Wallow, Nampa. Presented a letter from Bear Wallow Road residents. They disagree, too expensive.

Joan Pancheri, 572 Cabarton Road, lives in Nampa. Has a ranch here and is satisfied with her sewer and water system. Costs/fees each year are unknown. Has a lot 25 acres across, nearer to town and would consider it as a site.

Brent Harris, 52 Panorama Dr, also Nampa, is opposed, agreed with previous comments. Project is much too expensive.

Bob Carr, 214 Polecat Ridge Road, Cascade. Site is at odds with existing uses of the land. Negatively impacts the natural beauty of the area. Proposed metal barn-like buildings are too large and too high at 46' and cannot be disguised, also will encourage light pollution. Noise will be a problem with the fans, electric motors, and trucks coming and going. Road has problems at the "S" turns. Wetlands are involved and it will soften the road.

Financial concerns are the biggest problem. Thinks we should get the money before the C. U. P. Speaking for the folks at Polecat Ridge, they are adamantly opposed.

Roy Hancock, 214 Polecat Road, Cascade, agreed with Mr. Carr. Doesn't think they need a sewer system at all, except for a very, very, small select group on West Mountain.

Gerald Teuter, strongly opposed to this project. Met at the Ashley Inn., a hundred property owners were opposed.

Vern Ward, agreed that what's been going on has been a drain on taxpayers and delivered a letter from Kelvin and Karen Johnson.

Dean Sinkviler (spelling of name uncertain), Cascade, wanted to add that he has been up here for a lot of years. Objects to continuum of engineering firms spending his tax money.

David MacGregor, 17 Snowbank Road, Cascade, a close neighbor. Agreed with everything said. Site is not good for the following reasons: Ingress/egress of proposed road is poor, and has had many accidents within the 200 yard radius. Location is in wetland area, requires further wetland permitting (an extra cost), and the plant will stink. It encroaches on neighbors, and it's like building the plant on Ann Morrison Park in Boise. Site was chosen because it was the only site.

Those who need the system should pay for it. It's too expensive. Has seen no one in favor of it except the Board of Directors.

Scott Worthen, 196 West Mountain Road, Cascade. Agreed, and added that also absent is a comprehensive business plan. Adamantly opposed.

John Mabbutt spoke in rebuttal. Sympathizes with folks on both sides. Proposal calls for a trunk line to serve the West Mountain and shoreline residents. Understands that Cabarton area folks don't need it. They currently are pursuing a Corps of Engineers grant. A C.U.P is needed to decide – Is this site suitable? They are trying to get the costs down.

Commissioner Cruickshank asked Mr. Mabbutt why the water portion was eliminated. Answer: District Health has advised they can't provide water without sewer. Sewer must precede water per Central District Health agency requirements. Mr. MacGregor is not in the District, but is impacted. Carol MacGregor is in the District.

They looked at another site, on the north side of the creek. It would be protected by the hill. Carol refused that site. Also, Leslie's lot on the corner was taken into account, but no deal could be made. Additionally, they approached the Allen's. The property across from Trinity Pines is out of the District. City of Cascade refuses to merge with them. They have approximately \$300,000. Expenses are \$35,000 to \$50,000 per year.

Lois Hartley added they were here quite by accident, they and their neighbors on Bear Wallow Road did not receive notice of the meeting.

Mr. Mabbutt added only those using the system will be charged fees. They weren't to go forward to attempt to find more favorable financing.

Bob Carr added they didn't know who favors the system and who opposes. Opting would be a "game-changer" for them. He thinks those in need are on West Mountain.

Operation and maintenance fees would also be \$50.00 per month. Mr. MacGregor objects to impact costs. To him it's devaluing his property. The whole project is not viable. It can't work.

Carl Broadbent admonishes the meeting is about the suitability of the site, not the viability of the entire project. The time to argue who is charged and who is not is for a later date.

Commissioner Cruickshank moved to table the decision until the Fourteenth of September at 1:00 p.m., after the Commissioners have heard the tape and will be present to vote. Second by Chairman Winkle and carried.

Public hearing adjourned at 10:23 a.m.

Carol McCoy Brown, Cascade District Ranger, Joe Harper Krassel District Ranger, Randy Hayman, planning and NEPA for the Boise National Forest, Dave Olson, PIO for Boise National Forest. Referring to a packet they submitted, they provided information on Wildlife Conservation as specifically tied to a Forest Plan, not a wildlife strategy.

Chairman Winkle thanked them for their presentation.

Commissioner Cruickshank then moved to amend the time of the discussion of South Lake Recreational Water and Sewer District on September 14<sup>th</sup> at 11:00 a.m. Seconded by Chairman Winkle and carried.

Adjourned at 11:53 a.m.

---

**GERALD "JERRY" WINKLE, CHAIRMAN**

**ATTEST:**

---

**ARCHIE N. BANBURY, CLERK**